

مركز مساواة لحقوق الواطنين لعرب في إسرائيل (ج.م)

מרכז מוסאוא לזכויות האזרחים הערבים בישראל (עיר) Mossawa Center The Advocacy Center for Arab Citizens of Israel

Contact Person: Rania Laham-Grayeb, Deputy Director

Address: P.O. Box 4471, Haifa 31043, Israel

Tel:+ 8555901-04-972 Fax: +972-04-8552772

Email: themossawacenter@gmail.com

Web: www.mossawa.org

THE MOSSAWA CENTER'S BRIEFING PAPER FOR THE US STATE DEPARTMENT HUMAN RIGHTS REPORT ON ISRAEL:

Discrimination Against the Arab Minority in Israel

24 October 2013

The Mossawa Center is pleased to submit this report to the US State Department to assist it in its consideration of Israel for its Human Rights Report on Israel. This paper provides a concise update of the key developments and discrepancies in the civil and political, socio-economic and the cultural status of the Arab minority in Israel over the past year.

Most Significant Human Rights Problem

In 2013, significant human rights problems continued in Israel, including institutional and societal discrimination against Arab citizens directly conflicting with Israel's financial interests. This discrimination is insidious. From the founding principles of the State of Israel to the lack of city planning in Arab sections of municipalities, discrimination is everywhere. Foreign aid continues to be utilized by Israel to discriminate against its minority populations.

Fundamental Laws in Israel Institutionalize Discrimination

Equality and non-discrimination, fundamental principles of a democracy, are consistently shoved aside by Israel to protect the Jewish state as Israel's Basic Law sets out that Israel is a 'Jewish and democratic state'. Israeli Basic Law grants the right to "life, body, and dignity" yet this right is subjugated to the protection of a Jewish state. In October 2013, the Supreme Court of Israel reiterated the difference

¹ The entire October 24, 2013 submission by Mossawa Center details the abandonment of the democratic principles of equality and non-discrimination by the State of Israel using religion as the foundation of the discrimination.

The Mossawa Center is the Advocacy Center for the Arab Citizens in Israel. Established in 1997, the Center is a non-profit, non-governmental organization that works to promote the social, economic, cultural and political rights of the Palestinian Arab citizens in Israel and the recognition of this community as a national indigenous minority, with their own national, cultural and historical distinctiveness.

²Basic Law: Human Dignity and Liberty, Purpose, Article 1, State of Israel, 1992. "The purpose of this Basic Law is to protect human dignity and liberty, in order to establish in a Basic Law the values of the State of Israel as a Jewish and democratic state."

between nationality and citizenship.³ The Supreme Court distinguishes between 'civic nationalism' in which one's nationality and political citizenship are identical, and 'ethnic nationalism,' in which the individual's belonging to a national group stems mainly from shared characteristics such as language, culture and religion.⁴ Thus, recognition of Israeli nationality, independent of being Jewish, undermines the Jewish state and is not allowed. Whether the state can be Jewish and democratic is an on-going debate. Erstwhile the state remains unwaveringly Jewish and the discrimination flowing from the Jewish state, discrimination based on religion, effects religious freedom.

Israel continues to avoid international law by hiding behind national security and a "State of Emergency," that has been in effect since 1948. By its very definition, the use of an emergency exception for the last 65 years by the state of Israel to justify derogation from international human rights obligations is farcical. For example, Israel uses the "State of Emergency" to justify the Citizenship Law which keeps families apart when one spouse is from Israel and the other spouse is from an "enemy state" like the Occupied Territories of Palestine (oPT).

Elections are considered fair in Israel but it merits mentioning that the Arab minority in Israel remains divided on how best to combat the fundamental discrimination found in the founding and actions of the State of Israel. Low turnout by Arab citizens is the result of a boycott against elections for a government that wishes to exclude and subrogate all non-Jewish citizens. In Jerusalem, the Palestinian population, which represents roughly 25% of the population tends to boycott elections.⁵

Section 1. Respect for the Integrity of the Person, Including Freedom from:

Arbitrary Interference with Privacy, Family, Home, or Correspondence

Israel does not have civil marriage and seeks to keep families apart by claiming national security. No documentation exists showing the spouses represent a security risk. Renewed again in April 2013, The *Law of Citizenship and Entry into Israel (Temporary Order)*⁶ has been renewed for eleven years based on Israel's continuing national security claim.⁷ Palestinians from the West Bank and Gaza are prohibited from obtaining permanent or temporary resident status in East Jerusalem or Israel.⁸ The citizenship law applies to married couples even when one spouse holds Israeli residency or citizenship.⁹ Parents with residency rights in Jerusalem and a Jerusalem identification card cannot automatically transfer their status

³Jonathan Cook, I am Israeli, *The Majalla*, Oct 15, 2013, http://www.majalla.com/eng/2013/10/article55246019.

⁴Dmitry Shumsky, Israel has two nationalities, not one, and they need a federation, *Haaretz*, Oct 10, 2013 http://www.haaretz.com/mobile/opinion/.premium-1.551498.

⁵ Local elections across Israel marred by boycott, scandals, *Ma'an News Agency*, Oct 22, 2013, http://www.maannews.net/eng/ViewDetails.aspx?ID=640069.

⁶Citizenship Law, State of Israel, last visited on Oct 23, 2013, http://www.knesset.gov.il/laws/special/eng/citizenship_law.htm

⁷Miriam Pellicano, Israeli law tears Palestinian families apart, *Aljazeera*, July 19, 2013, http://www.aljazeera.com/indepth/features/2013/07/20137813932642619.html.

⁸ Id.

⁹ Id.

to their children. ¹⁰ In 2012, the Supreme Court rejected a petition against the law, claiming that national security concerns outweigh the right to family life. ¹¹

Section 2. Respect for Civil Liberties, Including:

Freedom of Speech and Press¹²

At first blush, freedom of speech and press is respected in Israel. After closer examination it becomes clear how laws, regulations and implementation of the laws and regulations actually discriminate against the Arab minority living in Israel.

Arab voices are silenced as many Arab communities are still not connected to television cable otherwise available throughout Israel. Arab television stations do not receive state funding and cannot successfully raise private funds because the viewer numbers are low as Arab villages often do not have access to Israeli cable. Further compounding the problem is Arabic content, original or dubbed, on Israeli channels represents less than 5% of broadcasted material. The law requires a certain amount of content to have Arabic subtitles. After midnight for a few hours and at other inconvenient times, subtitles in Arabic may be available.

No Arabic radio station serves the south and central areas of Israel. An Israeli-Palestinian radio station, All for Peace Radio, was forced to operate exclusively on-line for lack of an operating license. The Second Authority also supervises 16 local radio stations. Only one is an Arabic radio station. Due to the difficulty in acquiring broadcasting licenses, more than sixteen local Arabic radio stations broadcast without a license in Arab localities throughout Israel. Frequently the stations are shut down by government authorities and heavy fines are imposed. The lack of state funding and infrastructure quells the Arab voice in Israel violating the right of freedom of press and freedom of expression.

Consider the annual total budget for both Israeli television stations, Channel 2 and Channel 10, is about 1 billion NIS for production and programming. Despite its large budget, less than half of one percent goes to the programming for the Arab minority, which makes up twenty percent of the population. Limiting accessibility of the Arab minority to public services such as the TV, continues to violate Arab human rights.

Implementation continues to be a problem and remains a tool for institutional discrimination against the Arab minority. For example, the council of the Second Authority for Television and Radio has 15 seats; 12 of them are filled by Jewish members while the two seats allocated to Arab members remain vacant. The Second Authority and the government declined to appoint any Arab representatives to fill these seats although candidates are continually proffered.

Internet Freedom

Internet is widely available but as more of the Arab population is impoverished a greater number of Arabs in Israel do not have access to the internet. Statistics show that roughly 60% of Arab homes do not have

¹⁰ Id.

Id.

¹¹Mossawa Center's report "Nationality and Entry into Israel Law (Temporary Order)," 2012, available at: http://www.mossawacenter.org/my_documents/publication2/2012%20Citizenship%20and%20Entry%20into%20Israel%20Law.pdf

¹²Information in this section provided through multiple interviews with the Director of Mossawa and Owner of Hala TV, Jafar Farah in September 2013.

the internet. ¹³Lack of access to the internet combined with bans on books published in enemy states largely effecting books being published in Arabic, close off cost effective educational resources for low-income people as the Arab minority in Israel who have 32% lower monthly income than Jewish people in Israel. ¹⁴

Since 2008, licenses to import books published in an "enemy state" have not be renewed, even if the books were imported via another country. This ban infringes the right of the readers of Arabic to the freedom of information, culture and education. Due to exclusive print and distribution rights granted to publishing houses in Syria and Lebanon, most of the Arabic books in the academic and public libraries in Israel are printed either in Syria or Lebanon. For example, customs authorities held up a new version of a seminal work on Jewish thought because importing this Arabic-language edition "violates laws regarding trade with the enemy." The book was printed in Beirut. The work is the Kuzari by Yehuda Halevi, a Spanish Jewish poet and philosopher who died so long ago in 1141, hardly a threat to national security in the year 2013. Banning these books from entering Israel would mean preventing readers of Arabic in Israel access to Arabic translations of international publications such as dictionaries, encyclopedias and classic world literature.

Academic Freedom and Cultural Events

Education

Perhaps most insidious is the difference in education and educational opportunities between the Jewish and Arab children living in Israel. A recent OECD Report on labor in Israel shows that Arab students receive inadequate education in terms of core subjects and there is a failure to provide sufficient professional studies to the Arab community explaining the high poverty rates in Israel of 21% of which more than 50% live below the poverty with an even greater number at risk of falling into poverty. There is a shortage of classrooms in Arab public schools. If there is no response to the shortage of classrooms, it is estimated that by the year 2016, the number of classrooms required will increase to 8,216. The gap between Arab pupils and Jewish pupils are increasing. Only 11% of the Arab minority are accepted to college or university, and that Arabs constitute only 10% of all those who obtain

¹³ Maya Epstein, The real masters of Israeli Internet: Haredim and Arabs, *Haaretz*, May 10, 2012, http://www.haaretz.com/business/the-real-masters-of-israeli-internet-haredim-and-arabs-1.429500.

Sergio Yahni, Israel poorest country in OECD, Alternative News, Oct 20, 2013,
http://www.alternativenews.org/english/index.php/politics/israeli-sosaciety/7207-israel-poorest-country-in-the-oecd.
AkivaEldar, Israel bans Lebanese edition of Jewish philosophical work, *Haaertz*, http://www.haaretz.com/jewish-world-news/israel-bans-lebanese-edition-of-jewish-philosophical-work.premium-1.430469.

¹⁶Id.

¹⁷Gad Lior, OECD: Haredi, Arab integration insufficient, *Ynet News*, May 23, 2013, http://www.ynetnews.com/articles/0,7340,L-4383139,00.html. See also OECD Report, Review of Recent Developments and Progress in Labour Market and Social Policy in Israel - Slow Progress Towards a More Inclusive Society, May 13, 2013, http://www.oecd.org/els/israel.htm.

¹⁸MossawaCenter Main Findings of the 2013 State Budget.

¹⁹Id.

²⁰Id.

bachelor's degrees. ²¹ Statistics were unavailable on the number of Arab students accepted to the university.

Once education class sizes become comparable to a Jewish school's class size there will be approximately 4,000 additional positions in education within the Arab education system, including in special care and in kindergarten special education. ²² There is a tremendous shortage of special services, such as psychological services and educational counselling in Arab schools. The increase of crime and violence in schools highlights the need to implement government decisions from September 2011 and to fund security for schools in the Arab community. Less than 3% of the employees in the higher education system are Arab. A high percentage of Arab students study in universities abroad, especially in Eastern Europe and Jordan. It is estimated that between 6,000-8,000 Arab students study abroad as a result of a wide range of obstacles faced by Arab students such as the quality of the educational system and the psychometric exam.²³

No university exists in Israel using the Arabic language for instruction. This may not seem to be particularly insidious but the lack of a university providing instruction in Arabic ensures disproportionate benefit to Jewish students of educational funding from the U.S. and EU. Arab students are closed out of university study which means they have less degrees to choose from because colleges in Israel tend to have lower admission standards and provide few degrees, like one or two degrees. For example, a college in Nazareth teaches in Arabic but only provides two degree programs. Dependent on private funding, colleges do not reap the educational benefits from the state or from international community in the same way the universities within Israel do. Israel is creating and in some instances has created a second class citizenry not educated to assume professional and technological positions with the state, many of those positions created through international funding.

Culture

Discrimination against the Arab culture is rampant in the implementation of the state budget. Mossawa monitors the state budget and the use of funding. The analysis of the 2013 State Budget shows gross inequalities in the treatment of the Arab minority cultural rights. The entire State Budget for Culture amounted to NIS 642 million. Arab culture receives about NIS 12 million or two percent, including the allocation for the Arabic Language Academy. Approximately nine million NIS is allocated to Arab cultural activities and only 1.25 million NIS to the Arabic Language Academy. The Ministry of Culture consistently discriminates against the Arab community in allocating its budget.²⁴ Over the last six years, the community has consistently been allotted less than 3% of the Ministry's funds, though the number of organizations applying for funding has more than doubled.²⁵

No Arab heritage museum exists in Israel, and the one existing Arab school of art received minimal funding. As a result, almost no Arabic films are selected for funding by the cinema foundations. Through

²¹YardenSkop, Israeli Arabs face extensive barriers to getting college education, report says, *Haaretz*, June 19, 2013, http://www.haaretz.com/news/national/.premium-1.530660.

²²MossawaCenter Main Findings of the 2013 State Budget.

²³Id.

²⁴Mossawa Center Main Findings of the 2013 State Budget.

²⁵Id.

co-financing and co-producing with Israeli TV stations, Hebrew cinema institutions are able to access funding of more than half a billion NIS. Arab cinema organizations lack access to these funding opportunities as Israeli stations give clear priority to Hebrew productions. The difficulty in acquiring core funding from the national resource also makes it problematic in accessing international funding opportunities as the vast majority of the cinema funds incorporate a co-financing policy.²⁶

The Mossawa 2013 State Budget Analysis also found that while the Cinema Law allocates 60 million NIS each year for Hebrew cinema. Five Jewish cinema foundations control the funds allocated by Israel to Israeli cinema; however, there are no Arab employees, and no Arabs in the evaluation committees of these foundations.²⁷ Israel impedes the cultural freedom of its Arab citizenry.

Freedom of Peaceful Assembly and Association

Israeli forces are demolishing homes of Bedouin Arabs in the Negev. Bedouin Arabs are forcibly removed from their homes. Standing outside their home and watching the home be demolished the men are often arrested for objecting to the demolition.²⁸ Bedouins were not consulted as part of the home demolition plan, the Prawer Plan.²⁹

Arab citizens, have been arrested for peaceful demonstrations.³⁰ In 2013, over sixty protestors were arrested because they oppose the Prawer Plan which if passed will uproot over 30,000+ Bedouin from their homes and force them into urban townships thereby destroying their culture and way of life.³¹ After Arab Members of the Knesset were kicked out of the floor of the Knesset, demonstrations ensued with 28 protestors being arrested.³² On August 19, 2013, not only were six residences demolished but residences were ordered to evacuate the area and remove debris from the demolished homes or risk a fine.³³

http://www.mossawacenter.org/en/item.asp?aid=840. See also "14 arrested including women and underage youth in Prawer protest and refused counsel," The MossawaCenter, published on July 13, 2013, last accessed on Sept 5, 2013, http://www.mossawacenter.org/en/item.asp?aid=1072; "Peaceful demonstrator arrested due to his national belonging: The Coalition Against Racism condemns the arbitrary arrest of Saber Abu-Ghalyounon, a Palestinian Arab citizen of Israel," *The MossawaCenter*, published on June 19, 2012, last accessed on Sept 5, 2013, http://www.mossawacenter.org/en/item.asp?aid=694.

²⁶ The Mossawa Center, A Briefing Paper: Restrictions on the Right to Freedom of Opinion and Expression of the Arab Minority and Arabic Media in Israel, May 2013.

²⁷Id.

²⁸MossawaCenter's 2013 Racism Report. See also MossawaCenter's report, "2013 Elections," September 2012.

²⁹Amira Hass, "Controversial resettlement plan: It's not just settlers who oppose Israel's plan to relocate Bedouin in West Bank," *Haaretz*, May 20, 2013, http://www.haaretz.com/news/national/it-s-not-just-settlers-who-oppose-israel-s-plan-to-relocate-bedouin-in-west-bank.premium-1.524176.

³⁰"Police forces limit the right to freedom of expression for peace activists during peaceful demonstration in Haifa," *The MossawaCenter*, published on Nov 26, 2012, last accessed on Sept 5, 2013,

³¹MossawaCenter, MossawaCenter monitors arrests made during Prawer Plan demonstrations, Aug 13, 2012, http://www.mossawacenter.org/he/item.asp?aid=1088.

³²Alison Deger, "As state nears Bedouin relocation plan, protests in Israel, West Bank, Gaza and Jerusalem," *Mondoweiss*, July 17, 2013, http://mondoweiss.net/2013/07/as-state-nears-bedouin-relocation-plan-protests-in-israel-west-bank-gaza-and-jerusalem.html.

³³MairavZonszein, "Israel destroys Bedouin homes in Jerusalem, threatens to expel community," +972 Magazine, Aug 20, 2013, http://972mag.com/israel-demolishes-bedouin-homes-in-jerusalem-threatens-to-expel-community/77638/.

Freedom of Religion

Please see Mossawa Center's Freedom of Religion Report submitted on October 21, 2013 for additional detail

Freedom of Movement, Internally Displaced Persons, Protection of Refugees, and Stateless Persons

The Mossawa Center 2013 State Budget Analysis shows the state budget designated to transportation development for 2012 amounted to 8 billion NIS, of which 80 million NIS, or 8.2% of the designated budget, was to be invested in projects for the "minority" sectors. The Ministry of Transportation's budget for developing inter-city roads was part of a program managed by Ma'ats Public Works Department. The lack of transparency of Ma'ats limits the ability to influence the priorities of the company.³⁴

Also Arab locales reported difficulties in creating transportation services inside many Arab areas due to infrastructure problems such as narrow streets, topography, and traffic safety issues. In addition, the lower number of daily trips in Arab areas compared with the number of daily trips in Jewish areas demonstrates deficiencies of transportation services in Arab communities. Also, the number of final destinations in Arab areas is lower compared to the number in Jewish areas, thus limiting the accessibility of the Arab public to their jobs.³⁵

Section 3. Respect for Political Rights: The Right of Citizens to Change Their Government

Arab political participation is constantly under threat. Currently pending before the Knesset is the "Law of Governance" which will be two amendments to the Basic Law. On July 31, 2013, the Knesset plenum approved the first reading of the two proposed amendments. Perhaps the most controversial part of the law is a clause raising the threshold to enter Knesset to four percent of the national vote – up from two percent. The change would keep out some current Knesset factions out, specifically many Arab minority factions. ³⁶ Israel's electoral system is based on nation-wide proportional representation meaning the number of seats which every political party list receives in the Knesset is proportional to the number of voters who voted for it. The only limitation is the 2% qualifying threshold. In other words, a party must receive at least 2% of the votes in order to receive a seat. According to this system, the voters vote for a party list, and not for a particular person on the list. ³⁷ Approximately half of the political parties that would currently be eliminated because of this increase are Arab political parties. Through this legislation the State of Israel seeks to quell the voice of Arabs in Israel.

Besides the threat to smaller minority political parties, the requirement that a political party recognize the Jewish character of the state, i.e. lack of Israeli nationality, disrespects political rights. As previously mentioned, many within the Arab minority continue to boycott elections, explaining low voter participation in the Arab community. A democracy based on religion, such as Israel, by its very nature stymies democracy and involvement of people in the political process who are not members of the state religion.

³⁴Mossawa Center Main Findings of the 2013 State Budget.

³⁵Id.

³⁶MaayanaMiskin, 'Governance Bill' Passes after Heated Debate, *ArutzSheva*, July 31, 2013http://www.israelnationalnews.com/News/News.aspx/170468#.UlmiWFDI2MM.

³⁷State of Israel, last visited on Oct 13, 2013, http://www.knesset.gov.il/description/eng/eng_mimshal_beh.htm

Section 4. Corruption and Lack of Transparency in Government

Corruption in Israel is not considered corruption if the result is discriminatory policy against the Arab minority. What would otherwise be considered corruption in a less zealot democracy is considered protection of national interests as the national interest is to protect and maintain a Jewish state above democracy. Recent reports within Israel and by the OECD show Jewish discrimination against the Arab minority is costing Israel billions as Arab citizens continue to be discriminated against through lack of educational opportunities and by Jewish banks. ³⁸Leading researchers in Israel, Prof.EranYashiv, head of Tel Aviv University's Department of Public Policy, and Dr.NitzaKasir of the Bank of Israel's Research Department, show how Israel's policies are economically flawed. ³⁹ Israel was in last place among OECD members and it is because of the continued discrimination against the Arab minority. ⁴⁰ These policies causing discrimination and disparity in labor, education and economics are not based on rational choice theory as the policies are costing Israel billions, yet the United States currently appropriates \$2.9 billion in foreign aid for Israel. ⁴¹

The problem is often not the identification of a problem but the follow up and transparency in government action after a problem has been identified. For example, the Arab community is discriminated against regarding opening of bank accounts and extensions of lines of credit. The Knesset met in July to discuss with no results. Bank fees are higher in Arab banks. Arabs interest spread, the gap between the interest they receive on savings and what they pay for credit, is wider than that of Jewish customers. A statement from a government official assuring Arab citizens that steps will be taken is not transparency. Transparency in government would show the depth of the discrimination, steps to correct and steps to remedy past discrimination. Instead, Israel provides nothing.

Another example is the disposition of the price tag attacks occurring not only in the settlements but also within Israel's borders. Often improvement of a situation can be seen through a certain metric or initiative but the discrimination remains and the situation unchanged. For example, a special police task force was created in late 2012 to investigate and prosecute violence against Arabs in the West Bank. Yet the violence increased with over 180 attacks in the first six months of 2013 compared to 200 attacks in the entire previous year. ⁴⁶ Even though the Nationalistic Crimes Unit was established in late 2012, no culprits have yet been held accountable. ⁴⁷

³⁸Emily L. Hauser, "Discriminating Against Arabs Costs Israel Billions," *The Daily Beast*, Jun 18, 2013, http://www.thedailybeast.com/articles/2013/06/18/discriminating-against-arabs-costs-israel-billions.html.

³⁹Closing the gap between Israel's Arabs and Jews, *Haaretz*, June 14, 2013, http://www.haaretz.com/opinion/.premium-1.529703.

⁴⁰ OECD Report, Review of Recent Developments and Progress in Labour Market and Social Policy in Israel - Slow Progress Towards a More Inclusive Society, May 13, 2013, http://www.oecd.org/els/israel.htm.

⁴¹Foreign Assistance by Country Office, last visited Oct 21, 2013, http://foreignassistance.gov/CountryIntro.aspx.

⁴²Sharon Shpurer, The Israeli bank that opens its doors to everyone - except Arabs, *Haaretz*, July 30, 2013, http://www.haaretz.com/business/.premium-1.538667#.

⁴³Sharon Shpurer, Knesset committee to discuss banking discrimination against Arabs, *Haaretz*, July 30, 2013, http://www.haaretz.com/business/.premium-1.538838.

⁴⁴Id.

⁴⁵Day-to-day racism, Haaretz, Aug 1, 2013, http://www.haaretz.com/opinion/1.539067

⁴⁶ Daniel K. Eisenbund, Special police task force probes rash of 'price tag' crimes, *Haaretz*, Oct 1, 2013, http://www.jpost.com/National-News/Special-police-task-force-probes-rash-of-price-tag-crimes-327609.

Section 5. Governmental Attitude Regarding International and Nongovernmental Investigation of Alleged Violations of Human Rights

On March 26, 2012, the Israeli foreign ministry cut all contact with the UN Human Rights Council, the High Commissioner for Human Rights' Office and the Human Rights Treaty Bodies. Israel refuses to cooperate with a fact-finding mission to investigate the settlement issue and whether the rights of Palestinians are being abused. Not only is Israel in violation of its obligations under international law but undermines the equality and universality of the human rights structure. The Universal Period Review will now occur for Israel at the end of October 2013.

Israel demonstrates resistance to improving the rights of its citizens and repealing discriminatory legislation. Israel refused to attend its UPR. This refusal suggests state recognition of growing international disapproval and chooses to disregard the authority of Israeli ratified international mechanisms. The Mossawa Center expresses its concern that Israel has shown an increasing isolationism that may petrify its discriminatory institutions.

Section 6. Discrimination, Societal Abuses, and Trafficking in Persons

Pending and Current Discriminatory Legislation

Perhaps the most insidious of legislation is the Prawer Plan that plans to displace 30,000-40,000 Bedouins. Worse are the home demolitions already occurring in the Negev. The State of Israel does not wait for the passage of the plan to demolish the homes in the Negev but uses land planning techniques to enforce its plan without passage of the law. The State of Israel creates its own facts by not recognizing the villages resulting in withholding basic services. Then because the villages are not officially established eviction is possible and the people considered trespassers. If the people are given land in return they do not want to accept because they are being given land where those land owners were forced to leave. The Bedouins do not want someone else's land acquired through someone else's misery. By not accepting others land, the Bedouin are then forced to accept pitiful financial refunds.

Israeli forces are demolishing homes of Bedouin Arabs in the Negev with more than 1,000 homes destroyed since 2011.⁴⁸ Al-Arakib, a Bedouin village known for being demolished over 50 times since 2010, was again destroyed for the 54th time in August 2013.⁴⁹ The day after the 54th demolition four leaders from nearby towns were arrested.⁵⁰ The idea is to enforce a restraining order on the community leaders to physically keep them from their homeland.⁵¹The implementation of the Prawer Plan prior to becoming law demonstrates a serious rule of law problem. Law cannot rule a land when homes are demolished prior to the acceptance of a law to take that action and without the input of the people being adversely affected.

⁴⁷Police chief: Attacks aim to set Israel, and beyond, aflame, *Israel Hayom*, May 2013, http://www.israelhayom.com/site/newsletter_article.php?id=10091.

⁴⁸Dr.Thabet Abu Rass, "Two years since Prawer Plan," Communist Party of Israel, Sept 28, 2013, http://maki.org.il/en/?p=1288.

⁴⁹ Allison Deger, "Has the Prawer Plan begun?" *Mondoweiss*, Aug 29, 2013, http://mondoweiss.net/2013/08/has-the-prawer- plan-begun.html.

⁵⁰ Id.

⁵¹Id.

Further eroding the rule of law in Israel is the manner in which the demolitions are being carried out. Bedouin Arabs are being forcibly removed from their homes. Standing outside their home and watching the home be demolished often the men are often arrested for objecting to the demolition. ⁵²Bedouins were not consulted as part of the home demolition plan, the Prawer Plan. ⁵³The home demolitions are outside of democratic rule.

Today, 70,000 Arab Bedouin citizens live in 35 villages created prior to 1950.⁵⁴ The villages are deemed "unrecognized" by the State of Israel and the inhabitants labelled as trespassers to justify the states denial of citizens access to state infrastructure like water, electricity, sewage, education, health care and roads. The State of Israel wants the Arab Bedouin land. Israel intends to reforest, build new settlements and build military centers.⁵⁵ The Prawer Plan has already passed its first reading in the Knesset and requires two more readings in the Knesset to become law.⁵⁶Even though the Prawer Plan is not yet law it is already being implemented on a daily basis as Bedouin Arabs are rounded up through economic intimidation, home demolitions and arrests, forcing them to move to state approved towns.⁵⁷

The Prawer Plan is not the only discriminatory and anti-democratic legislation undermining the rule of law in Israel. Beyond the discrimination previously mentioned, the Israeli government seeks to institutionalize discrimination against Arabs in all facets of life.

Veterans Preference is a proposed bill that would give preference in jobs (including Civil Service), salary conditions, student housing, admission to higher education and land allocations for housing to people who served in the army. Unlike in the U.S., where military service is voluntary and the military preference in government hiring is seen as a benefit to military service, service is compulsory in Israel. There are exceptions to the services and Arab citizens have such a lawful exception. Further, the law in Israel does not allow a preference for military services, largely to protect the Orthdox Jewish population but the law also protects the Arab population from discrimination.

The Veterans Preference was approved in June 2013 by the Ministerial Committee for Legislation and is expected to pass in the Knesset.⁵⁸ This bill was overruled by PM Netanhayu in the previous session after two legal opinions found the bill unconstitutional and yet here is the bill again.

⁵² Coalition Against Racism in Israel 2013 Racism Report. See also Mossawa Center's Report, "2013 Elections," September 2012, http://www.mossawacenter.org/en/item.asp?aid=923.

⁵³Amira Hass, "Controversial resettlement plan: It's not just settlers who oppose Israel's plan to relocate Bedouin in West Bank," *Haaretz*, May 20, 2013, http://www.haaretz.com/news/national/it-s-not-just-settlers-who-oppose-israel-s-plan-to-relocate- bedouin-in-west-bank.premium-1.524176.

⁵⁴ Demolition and Eviction of Bedouin Citizens of Israel in the Naqab (Negev) - The Prawer Plan."Adalah , http://adalah.org/eng/?mod=articles&ID=1589#What-is-the-Prawer-Plan .

⁵⁵ Id.

⁵⁶Dr.Thabet Abu Rass, "Two years since Prawer Plan," Communist Party of Israel, Sept 28, 2013, http://maki.org.il/en/?p=1288.

⁵⁷"The Prawer-Begin Bill and the Forced Displacement of the Bedouin," Adalah, May 2013, http://adalah.org/Public/files/English/Publications/Articles/2013/Prawer-Begin-Plan-Background-Adalah.pdf.

⁵⁸Jonathan Lis, "Ministers approve bill giving job preference to IDF veterans," *Haaretz*, June 16, 2013, http://www.haaretz.com/news/national/.premium-1.530148.

The Veterans Preference effectively excludes Arabs from Civil Service jobs contrary to the Fair Representation and Basic Law of Israel. The *Law for Fair Representation of Palestinian Arab citizens*(2000) acknowledged Arab underrepresentation in Israel's public sector. No target of Arab inclusion as staff in ministries, state bodies and on boards of government companies was set until 2004 (10% Arab by 2010). The increasing Arab inclusive percentage was postponed and 10% Arab inclusion in civil service was extended to 2012.⁵⁹In the last thirteen years since the Fair Representation law was passed the percentage of Arabs in civil service positions remains below 10%. Further, the Arab population is exempted from national military service by law. Similarly to the home demolitions already being carried out in the Negev, pervasive discrimination exists like with the man who was not allowed to buy an apartment because he was Arab.⁶⁰The Veterans Preference is counter to the Fair Representation Law, Basic Law against discrimination and to the legal exemption from the mandatory national military service and serves only to institutionalize discriminatory practices against the Arab minority in Israel based on nationality, religion and gender.

Judicial Discrimination

In trying to find relief against the state's discrimination against the Arab minority the courts provide no relief. For example, in August 2013, the Haifa District Court acquitted seven members of the Arab minority on charges of attempted murder, while finding them guilty of attempted manslaughter and other offenses in the killing of Natan-Zada. Natan-Zada was a Jewish terrorist who murdered four Arabs and wounded 17 others on a bus on August 4, 2005. The convictions were based on evidence being presented and accepted that he was in police custody, negating the use of self-defense. This case is a continuing pattern of the illegitimate justice system and bias shown against Arabs. A study in 2011 conducted by the Israeli Bar Association and Israeli Courts Administration recognized Arabs are given jail sentences more often than Jews convicted of the same offenses and Arabs receive longer sentences than Jews who are jailed, yet while the problem has been recognized, steps have not been taken to change that situation.

Summary of Discrimination in Legislation

The discrimination is pervasive. Approximately 53 currently enforced laws perpetuate inequality and discrimination, restricting the rights of the Arab minority in Israel. ⁶³ Approximately 35 new discriminatory laws are pending before the 19th Knesset, elected in January 2013. ⁶⁴ The Arab minority cannot make a movement without running into a discriminatory law as continued preservation of the Jewish state above a democratic state does directly and indirectly impact the lives of the Arab minority in Israel.

⁵⁹Jonathan Cook, "Rampant employment discrimination against Palestinian workers in Israel," *Electronic Intifada*, May 21, 2010, http://electronicintifada.net/content/rampant-employment-discrimination-against-palestinian-workers-israel/8837.

⁶⁰ "Real Estate Exclusively for Jews Under Apartheid, Ramle, Israel," *You Tube*, October 8, 2013,City,http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=WpcoBKQ36JE&feature=youtu.be (News with English subtitles).

⁶¹Yonah Jeremy Bob,Identity, race and the courts: Martin v. Natan-Zada, *Jerusalem Post*, Aug 4, 2013, http://www.jpost.com/Diplomacy-and-Politics/Identity-race-and-the-courts-Martin-v-Natan-Zada-321969.

⁶²Israeli courts must end Anti-Arab discrimination, *Haaretz*, Aug 3, 2011, http://www.haaretz.com/print-edition/opinion/israeli-courts-must-end-anti-arab-discrimination-1.376666.

⁶³See Annex 1 for a complete listing of laws currently in force discriminating against the Arab minority in Israel.

⁶⁴See Annex 2 for a complete listing of laws currently pending before the 19th Knesset that discriminate against the Arab minority in Israel.

Incitement to Violence – Hate Speech

Arab elected officials are not given respite and are frequently ridiculed by colleagues in the Knesset. Despite laws criminalizing hate speech and incitement to violence, ⁶⁵ Members of the Knesset (MKs) frequently use hate speech against Arab MKs and Palestinian voters. State-funded religious organizations have advocated against employing, dating, or selling homes to Arabs; some groups enforce sanctions against Jews for violating these boycotts. ⁶⁶ No MK or private organization has been indicted under the incitement law for hate speech against Arabs or held liable under the boycott ban. In contrast, Arab MKs are often arrested while participating in legal, peaceful protests. ⁶⁷ The law is not blind in Israel.

Right to Health

The high quality of Israel's health system is not equally accessible as seen by the gap between Jews and Arabs recently reported by Israel's Central Bureau of Statistics. The average life expectancy for Israeli Jews exceeds that of Arab citizens by more than three years, by 3.7 years for men and 3.3 years for women in 2012.⁶⁸

Israel has one of the lowest infant mortality rates in the world, 3.5 deaths in the first year of 1,000 live births. ⁶⁹ Infant mortality among Israeli Arabs was 6.5 per 1,000 live births, compared to 2.7 for Jews. ⁷⁰ Even though infant mortality rates dropped over the past decade, the gap between Jews and Arabs increased. ⁷¹

The Mossawa Center State Budget analysis found that the three hospitals in Nazareth, which are the only hospitals in Arab areas, were not included in the Israeli development program, keeping the Arab hospitals from being a line item on the budget and from receiving development funding.⁷² Overcrowding in

⁶⁹ Id.	
⁷⁰ Id.	

⁷¹Id.

⁶⁵²⁰¹³ Written Replies of Israel 63rd Session of Committee on the Rights of the Child (CRC), pages 3-4 paragraphs 5-11. Available at: http://daccess-dds-ny.un.org/doc/UNDOC/GEN/G13/437/34/PDF/G1343734.pdf?OpenElement; see also 2009 UN Report of the Special Rapporteur on freedom of religion or belief, page 7 paragraph 16, available at: http://daccess-dds-ny.un.org/doc/UNDOC/GEN/G09/101/87/PDF/G0910187.pdf?OpenElement. For a more comprehensive look at the history of incitement laws in Israel, see Michal Buchhandler-Raphael, "Incitement to Violence under Israeli Law and the Scope of Protection of Political Speech under Israeli Freedom of Speech Jurisprudence: A Comparative Analysis and an Alternative Perspective." Available at: http://works.bepress.com/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1000&context=michal_buchhandler_raphael

⁶⁶The Forward and Daniel Epstin, "The King's Torah: a rabbinic text or a call to terror?" *Haaretz*, Jan 22, 2010, http://www.haaretz.com/jewish-world/2.209/the-king-s-torah-a-rabbinic-text-or-a-call-to-terror-1.261930; Uri Blau and Shai Greenberg, "A strange kind of mercy," *Haaretz*, May 27, 2011, http://www.haaretz.com/weekend/magazine/a-strange-kind-of-mercy-1.364417; MossawaCenter, "Extreme Rightwing groups promote boycott and segregation," Oct 10, 2012, http://www.mossawacenter.org/en/item.asp?aid=546.

⁶⁷See the MossawaCenter's shadow report for CERD, page 9, available at: http://www.mossawacenter.org/my_documents/publication2/2011%20CERD%20Submission.pdf

⁶⁸OferAderet, Israelis' life expectancy has risen by two years over past decade, *Haaretz*, Sep. 16, 2013, http://www.haaretz.com/news/national/.premium-1.547293.

⁷²Mossawa Center Main Findings of the 2013 State Budget.

hospitals harms patients and is prevalent especially in Arab communities. Funding to expand the availability of emergency medical services is not given to Arab hospitals.⁷³

The National Healthcare Law guarantees equal healthcare access to all, ⁷⁴ but the Bedouin in the Negev do not receive adequate healthcare due to lack of basic infrastructure and services. Bedouin villages have no pharmacies and few medical clinics, most of which are operated out of trailers on poor quality generators that cannot sustain uninterrupted refrigeration for medicine. ⁷⁵

No land for Arabs

The Mossawa Center 2013 State Budget Analysis shows the 2012 budget of the Israel Land Administration (ILA) amounted to 5.5 billion NIS. Most of the budget designated for the Arab population was used to evacuate the unrecognized villages in the Negev. There is an immediate need to disassemble the ILA in its current form, because its policies only increase discrimination. In order to solve these issues, there is a need to use a new method of marketing of state lands for developing and building in Arab areas.⁷⁶

Approximately 45% of Arab towns and villages do not have an authorized master plan. About 40% of land is authorized by detailed plans in the jurisdiction area, a rather high percentage, which is explained by the lack of master plans that meets the needs of these Arab areas. More than 50% of Arab towns and villages have requested an expansion of their jurisdiction areas, 45% were approved but the towns and villages are still waiting for the expansions to be implemented. Approximately 30% of Arab towns and villages do not have state lands in order to build schools, community centers etc. There is an immediate need to build new neighborhoods and develop existing neighborhoods to meet the urgent need of residential units. 27% of Arab households are not connected to sewage infrastructures. In fact, no new Arab villages have been established since 1948, while Jewish settlements are regularly established.

The Mossawa Center 2013 State Budget Analysis showed the 2012 Ministry of Housing budget allocated 80 million NIS for the development of housing in the Arab sector, 50% of which was designated for investment in the Negev (19 million NIS to Rahat). The Ministry aids in the development of new neighborhoods, but the Ministry had cancelled assistance for the construction of public buildings and development in old neighborhoods. The Ministry is also discriminatory in regards to subsidies for purchasing an apartment and housing grants.⁷⁸

Section 7. Worker Rights

Employment and social policy

The preference in hiring in civil service jobs is granted to applicants who completed military service, even where there is no link between the applicant's military service experience and the skills and knowledge

⁷³Id.

⁷⁴State of Israel Ministry of Health, last visited on Sept 25, 2013, http://www.health.gov.il/English/Topics/RightsInsured/RightsUnderLaw/Pages/default.aspx.

⁷⁵OferAderet, Israelis' life expectancy has risen by two years over past decade, *Haaretz*, Sep. 16, 2013, http://www.haaretz.com/news/national/.premium-1.547293.

⁷⁶Mossawa Center Main Findings of the 2013 State Budget.

⁷⁷Id.

⁷⁸Id.

required for the position. Arab employees comprise only 6.97% of the public sector workforce, even though Arabs constitute 20% of the population and should benefit from a target participation quota set by the *Law for Fair Representation of Palestinian Arab citizens* for 10% employment by 2010. Rather than making the 2010 target of 10% and following the law to increase the percentage of Arabs employed, the 10% target was set again for 2012 with the government consistently breaking its word. Only 2% of industrial zones are located in Arab towns, and the lack of public transportation and day-care facilities for Arab workers contribute to significantly higher unemployment rates in the community. Arab employees work in unskilled labor compared to 7.1% of Jewish employees, and a higher percentage of Jewish employees work in management, business, and finance than Arab employees. On 40 towns with the highest unemployment rates are Arab. Furthermore, the extremely low rate of participation in the workforce by Palestinian Arab women – 21.9% in 2011 compared to 58.9% among their Jewish counterparts among the lowest in the world, and far below the average (62%) in OECD countries. Arabs earn 70% of the income of Jewish workers, and 12% of Arabs earn less than minimum wage.

Discrimination in Agriculture

The Mossawa Center 2013 State Budget Analysis shows the Ministry of Agriculture has disproportionately allocated the budget for agricultural development, with over 99% of the budget designated to support Jewish farmers through different agriculture institutions such as kibbutzim. Increased allocations supporting agriculture in Arab areas will help create a source of livelihood for thousands of families and especially for women.⁸⁷

⁷⁹Jillian Kestler-D'Amours, Israeli Military Service Requirement Discriminates Against Arab Citizens, *Al-Monitor*, May 5, 2013, http://www.al-monitor.com/pulse/originals/2013/05/israeli-army-service-rights-discrimination.html. See also *Civil Service Law (Appointments) -2002, (Proposed Amendment – Affirmative Action)*, which ties civil service employment to military service or national service. Coalition against Racism, "Bill Granting Preference to Release Army Personnel is Widening the Gap", July19, 2011.Available at:http://www.fightracism.org/en/Article.asp?aid=103.

⁸⁰English translation of extracts of the report by the Parliamentary Enquiry Committee on the Employment of Arabs in the Public Sector, the Israeli Knesset, February 2008.

⁸¹Jonathan Cook, "Rampant employment discrimination against Palestinian workers in Israel," *Electronic Intifada*, May 21, 2010, http://electronicintifada.net/content/rampant-employment-discrimination-against-palestinian-workers-israel/8837.

⁸²AlaaHamdan and YaserAwad, "The Equality Index of Jewish and Arab Citizens in Israel." *The Sikkuy Report*. 2009, page 61. Available at: http://www.sikkuy.org.il/english/en2009/r_sikkuy09.pdf

⁸³Central Bureau of Statistics (CBS), Statistical Abstract of Israel 2012, Table 12.18; Table 12.12.

⁸⁴CBS, Statistical Abstract of Israel, 2012, Table 12.1.

⁸⁵OECD, *Overview of Gender Differences in OECD Countries*, available at, http://www.oecd.org/document/51/0,3746,en_2649_34819_44720243_1_1_1_1_0.html.

⁸⁶OECD, Review of Labor, Market And Social Policies, ISRAEL, Paris, 2010, page 146.

⁸⁷Mossawa Center Main Findings of the 2013 State Budget.

Discrimination in Business and Tourism

Arab businesses continue to be stymied by the State of Israel. Land allocations are not given to Arabs resulting in less businesses being run by Arabs. 88 Arab business owners feel they receive less business and governmental bids according to a survey of Arab business owners done by the Economy Ministry. 89 The Mossawa Center 2013 State Budget Analysis shows Arab areas in Israel, including the city of Nazareth, are not included in the Ministry of Tourism's plans or on the tourism map published by the Ministry. The Ministry fails to utilize the potential which lies in developing tourism in Arab areas. Tourism in these areas can contribute in solving the employment problem by creating job opportunities.

CONCLUSION

especially for Arab women.⁹⁰

An Arab living in Israel encounters discrimination everywhere. Arab citizens run into problems educating their children, getting to work, starting businesses, having bank accounts, capitalizing on tourism monies, buying an apartment, getting a job, getting into the university, procuring books in their language or even just watching television programming in their own language, one of Israel's national languages. For the Bedouins, this type of discrimination is benign as they watch their ancestral lands confiscated, homes demolished and men arrested. The minority is oppressed and many boycott elections. Israel is a democracy on paper but not in practice. In practice Israel is a religious state and through complex, intertwined institutional discrimination manages to use international funding from the United States to hold up inefficient policies to create a second class non-Jewish citizenry.

⁸⁸MeiravArlosoroff, It ain't easy being an Arab citizen of Israel, statistics show, *Haaretz*, Mar 7, 2013, http://www.haaretz.com/business/business-opinion/it-ain-t-easy-being-an-arab-citizen-of-israel-statistics-show.premium-1.507901.

⁸⁹Billie Frenkel, Arab employers complain of discrimination, *Ynet*, June 11, 2013 http://www.ynetnews.com/articles/0,7340,L-4390376,00.html.

⁹⁰MossawaCenter Main Findings of the 2013 State Budget.

Annex 1

Footnote 63

Laws in Israel currently discriminating against the Arab minority:

- 1. Criminal Procedure Law Interrogating Suspects Amendment No. 6;
- 2. Israeli Prisons Ordinance Amendment No. 43 Prisoner-Attorney Meetings;
- 3. Citizenship Law Amendment No. 10;
- 4. "Anti-Boycott Law" Prevention of Damage to the State of Israel through Boycott;
- 5. "Nakba Law" Amendment No. 40 to the Budgets Foundations Law;
- 6. Israeli Prisons Ordinance Amendment No. 40 (Meetings with Lawyers);
- 7. Law to Strip Payments from a Current or Former Member of Knesset due to a Crime;
- 8. "Foreign Government Funding Law" Law on Disclosure Requirements for Recipients of Support from a Foreign State Entity;
- 9. Foreign Property Ownership Israel Lands Law (Amendment No. 3);
- 10. "Admissions Committees Law" Cooperative Societies Ordinance Amendment No. 8;
- 11. "Pardon Law" or "Amnesty Law" Termination of Proceedings and Deletion of Records in the Disengagement Plan Law; Extension of Detention Criminal Procedure Law (Suspects of Security Offenses) (Temporary Order) Amendment No. 2;
- 12. Absorption of Discharged Soldiers Law Amendment No. 12;
- 13. "Negev Individual Settlements" Negev Development Authority Law Amendment No. 4;
- 14. Land (Acquisition for Public Purposes) Ordinance Amendment No. 10;
- 15. National Priority Areas The Economic Efficiency Law Legislative Amendments for Implementing the Economic Plan for 2009-2010;
- Child Vaccinations and Child Allowances Economic Efficiency Law; Israel Land Administration Law - Amendment No. 7;
- 17. Regional Councils Law (Date of General Elections) Special Amendment No. 6; Criminal Procedure Law Interrogating Suspects Amendment No. 4;
- 18. Absorption of Discharged Soldiers Law Amendment No. 7: Benefits for Discharged Soldiers;
- 19. Criminal Procedure Law (Detainee Suspected of Security Offence) (Temporary Order);
- 20. "Ban on Family Unification" Citizenship and Entry into Israel Law (Temporary Order);
- 21. Law of Political Parties Amendment No. 12; Use of Hebrew Date Law; Knesset Law; Basic Law: The Government;
- 22. Second Authority for Television and Radio Law; Public Lands Law (Eviction of Squatters);

- 23. Interpretation Law;
- 24. Foundations of Law Act;
- 25. Religious Jewish Services Law; Law of Yad Yitzhak Ben-Zvi (1969) and Law of Mikve Israel Agricultural School (1976);
- 26. Protection of Holy Sites Law;
- 27. Broadcasting Authority Law;
- 28. National Planning and Building Law -Limitation of Water, Electricity and Telephone;
- 29. National Planning and Building Law; Basic Law: Israel Lands;
- 30. Israel Land Administration Law; Basic Law: The Knesset; State Education Law; Jewish National Fund Law;
- 31. Land Acquisition Law (Actions and Compensation);
- 32. Entry into Israel Law;
- 33. Citizenship Law;
- 34. World Zionist Organization-Jewish Agency (Status) Law;
- 35. Law of Return;
- 36. Absentees' Property Law; State Stamp Law;
- 37. Flag and Emblem Law;
- 38. Law and Government Ordinance, Article 18A; Defense Regulations (Times of Emergency), Regulation 125 (Closed Zones); and Trade with the Enemy Ordinance

Annex 2

Footnote 64

Racially discriminatory legislation currently pending in the 19thKnessett as of September 24, 2013:

- 1. Bill to amend the Citizenship Law imposing loyalty oath for persons seeking naturalization in Israel and Israeli citizens seeking first ID cards;
- 2. Bill to amend the Basic Law: Human Dignity and Liberty and limit the judicial review powers of the Supreme Court to rule on matters of citizenship;
- 3. Immigration to Israel Bill;
- 4. Defamation of IDF Soldiers The "*Jenin, Jenin* Bill" Bill to amend the Defamation Prohibition Law;
- 5. Shalit Bill Preventing Visits Bill;
- 6. Shalit Bill Restriction of Visitation for a Security Prisoner Bill;
- 7. Shalit Bill Release of Captives and Kidnapped Persons Bill;
- 8. Shalit Bill Imprisonment of Requested Prisoners;
- 9. Bill to Fight Terrorism;
- 10. Bill to amend on Participation in an Act of War or Terrorism against the State Law;
- 11. Denial of Privileges from a Prisoner Belonging to a Terrorist Organization that is Holding an Israeli Captive and Bill to amend Prison Ordinance Law;
- 12. "The Goals of Education" Bill to amend the State Education Law;
- 13. "Universal Jurisdiction Bill" Associations (Amutot) Law Amendment;
- 14. "NGO Loyalty to a Jewish and Democratic State Bill" Preserving the Values of the State of Israel Bill;
- 15. "Bill on Foreign Funding of NGOs" Bill on Income of Public Institutions Receiving Donations from Foreign State Entity (Legislative Amendments);
- 16. Exceptions to the Registration of an Association Bill to Amend Associations [Amutot] Law;
- 17. Taxation of Income of Public Institutions that Receive a Donation from a Foreign State Entity a Bill to Amend Income Tax OrdinanceRegulation of Bedouin Settlement in the Negev Bill;
- 18. Rights of those who Performed Military or National Service Bill; Civil Service Law (Appointments) Amendment (Affirmative Action)Bill;
- 19. Contributors to the State Bill; Exemption of Discharged Soldiers from National Insurance Fees a Bill to amend National Insurance Law;

- 20. Rewarding the Perseverance of Compulsory Military Service Soldiers and Civil Service Volunteers in order to Ensure their Ability to Acquire a Higher Education Bill;
- 21. Reduction of the Tax Rate that Applies to the Special Remuneration a Bill to amend the Reserve Service Law;
- 22. Encouragement of the Study of Engineering and Technology a Bill to amend the Absorption of Discharged Soldiers Law;
- 23. Exemption of Lone Soldiers from Payment of Television Fee a Bill to amend the Broadcasting Authority Law;
- 24. Mandatory Recruitment a Bill to amend the Security Service Law; Civil Service Bill;
- 25. Civil Service Preference Bill; Denial of the Right to Wages Earned on Election Day to an Individual who does not Vote a Bill to amend the Knesset Elections Law;
- 26. Determination of the Qualifying Election Threshold a Bill to amend the Basic Law: The Knesset;
- 27. Determination of the Qualifying Election Threshold a Bill to amend Basic Law: The Knesset;
- 28. Qualifying Election Threshold a Bill to amend Basic Law: the Knesset;
- 29. Increased Governance and Raising the Qualifying Election Threshold a Bill to Amend Basic Law: The GovernmentChanging the System of Government and a Bill to amend the Basic Law: The Government.